**NHS Wales**

**The use of settlement (compromise) agreements and confidentiality clauses**

**July 2013**

**NHS Wales Employers Unit, July 2013**

**Preface**

On 19th April 2013, the NHS Employers organisation published new guidance for NHS organisations in England to provide clarity around the use of compromise agreements and confidentiality clauses. NHS Employers have agreed that the document can be adapted for use in Wales and the document has accordingly been amended to reflect the position for NHS Wales and we are appreciative of NHS Employers for their support in the development of this document.

The guidance on the use of compromise agreements and confidentiality clauses was prompted by recent heightened media coverage about the need for openness, transparency and candour in the NHS following the publication of the public inquiry report into the failings of Mid Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust.

The need for the guidance was also highlighted by the attention drawn to the issue of using clauses which are intended to prevent or restrict staff or former employers from raising a genuine public interest concern under the Public Interest Disclosure Act (PIDA) 1998 (referred to in the media as 'gagging' clauses) raised in the Westminster Public Account Committee (PAC) and Health Select Committee in March 2013.

This guidance also outlines that any such agreement must include an express clause within it which outlines that the individual will not be prevented in any way, from making a disclosure in the public interest under the terms outlined in PIDA in order to approve payments going forward.

Additionally, the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013 which came into force on 25th June 2013, has changed the terminology regarding compromise agreements which will in future be called settlement agreements once a new ACAS statutory code has been finalised in this summer and the document has been written to reflect this change.

Further guidance and information for employers can also be found on the [NHS Employers Whistleblowing: Raising Concerns](http://www.nhsemployers.org/EMPLOYMENTPOLICYANDPRACTICE/UKEMPLOYMENTPRACTICE/RAISINGCONCERNS/Pages/Whistleblowing.aspx) at work web pages.

**NHS Wales Employers Unit, July 2013**

**The use of settlement (compromise) agreements and confidentiality clauses**

**1. Introduction**

There has been a lot of coverage about the need for openness, transparency and candour in the NHS following the publication of the *Report of the Mid Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust Public Inquiry* and the UK Government's initial response.

More specifically, attention has been drawn to the issue of using clauses which are intended to prohibit, or are perceived to prohibit, a member of staff or former employee from raising a genuine concern about patient safety or other issue, under the Public Interest Disclosure Act (PIDA) 1998, more commonly referred to in the media as "gagging" clauses. Any such clauses should not be confused with the use of confidentiality clauses often included in settlement (compromise) agreements which support both parties to move on after a dispute or where sensitive or personal information is involved.

Settlement (compromise) agreements used appropriately and in line with guidance, should ensure disputes can be settled and still maintain a culture of openness and transparency.

**2. Purpose of this document**

While the information in this document is not intended to provide legal advice, NHS Employers produced the original guidance with legal input from Capsticks LLP to help outline some of the legal boundaries which employers need to think about when considering the use of settlement (compromise) agreements when terminating employment. This includes providing clarity on:

• what a settlement (compromise) agreement is

• when to use a settlement (compromise) agreement

• an example clause relating to PIDA which should now be included in all agreements

• the statutory requirements

• the types of confidentiality clauses that can be legitimately used.

It also provides links to other related NHS guidance and resources.

**3. What is a settlement (compromise) agreement?**

A settlement (compromise) agreement is a legally binding agreement between an employer and employee used to set out the terms and conditions reached, when a contract of employment is to be terminated or a dispute is to be resolved.

Typically such terms might include a provision that the employer will make payment of salary, including any accrued, but untaken holidays up to the date of termination; payment in lieu of the employee's notice period if the employee is not required to work their notice; and/or payment of compensation for loss of employment.

The main function of a settlement (compromise) agreement is to draw a line under the employment relationship and, except in certain circumstances, prevent any further compensation claims being made against the employer by the employee in an Employment Tribunal or Court. Used appropriately they provide, for the employer, value for money as the cost of settlement can be less than the cost of defending the case; and for the employee, certainty of outcome. It may also be used to deal with all other claims which an employer or employee may have such as those relating to a breach of contract.

The issues they raise are complex, and may involve other members of staff or employees in other organisations, as well as patients. While settlement (compromise) agreements are intended to give employers and employees a high level of protection in relation to future claims being made, there are issues that cannot be compromised such as an employee’s rights to claim a protective award for failure to consult in collective redundancy and transfer of undertaking (TUPE) cases; or rights under PIDA as further explained below.

It is therefore essential that legal advice is sought before agreeing a settlement (compromise) agreement with an employee.

There are a number of statutory requirements that must be met in order for a settlement (compromise) agreement to be effective. These requirements are outlined below:

• The agreement must be in writing.

• The agreement must relate to a particular complaint, or particular proceeding. Employers will need to seek advice on all potential claims an employee may have to ensure potential employment claims are not left uncompromised.

• The employee must have received legal advice from an independent advisor. The independent advisor will typically be a qualified lawyer but may, for example, be a trade union official. The advice obtained by the employee prior to signature must be genuinely independent. This is therefore the employee’s opportunity to obtain their own advice about any aspect of the proposed agreement that they are unclear about, or are not comfortable with.

• The independent advisor must be identified in the agreement and have a current contract of insurance, or professional indemnity insurance, covering the risk of a claim against them by the employee in respect of the advice.

• The agreement must state that the conditions regulating settlement (compromise) agreements have been satisfied.

**4. When should a settlement (compromise) agreement be used?**

Settlement (compromise) agreements can be used in a number of circumstances, such as dismissals (including redundancy) or the settlement of an Employment Tribunal. They are particularly used to help minimise potentially long, drawn-out processes, before being able to terminate the employment, or where an employee has raised a grievance which the parties have not been able to be resolve. In cases where trust and confidence have irretrievably broken down, it can be mutually agreed that a termination of employment would be in everyone’s best interest.

Settlement (compromise) agreements should not be used to short-cut any investigations in relation to patient safety or care. It is therefore essential that they are not considered in isolation and employers ensure that they are aligned with processes and procedures relating to making referrals to professional bodies and safeguarding patients.

**5. Types of confidentiality clauses used within a settlement (compromise) agreement**

Confidentiality clauses are often used in settlement (compromise) agreements by employers across all sectors and can be mutually beneficial to protect the interests of both the employer and the employee. There are various types of confidentiality clauses used, but in the main these are likely to include:

1. Clauses which cover the terms of that agreement - for example, prohibiting any parties concerned from reporting the detail about the terms of the separation.

2. Clauses which protect confidential information gained by the employee as part of their employment, such as business-sensitive data or patient records. It is important to outline to all staff, their responsibilities to comply with the Data Protection Act 1998 and confidentiality within their terms and conditions of employment.

3. Clauses against derogatory comments being made which prevents the employee from making vexatious, disparaging or derogatory comments about the organisation and its staff. In such cases, there is usually a mutual clause which also prevents the organisation from making disparaging or derogatory comments about the employee.

Whilst the situations outlined above are examples within which such clauses used, in every case it should be considered whether or not they are appropriate in the circumstances. The precise terms may need to vary from case to case.

In all cases where outlining a confidentiality and/or clause against non-derogatory comments within a settlement (compromise) agreement, it is essential that it is made explicitly clear to the employee, within the written agreement, that this does not prevent them from raising legitimate concerns about a patient safety, or other issue, in the public interest under the terms of PIDA. We therefore recommend that the following clause should be included in all agreements:

**For the avoidance of doubt, nothing in this Agreement shall prejudice any rights that the Employee has or may have under the Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998 and/or any obligations that the Employee has or may have to raise concerns about patient safety and care with regulatory or other appropriate statutory bodies pursuant to his or her professional and ethical obligations including those obligations set out in guidance issued by regulatory or other appropriate statutory bodies from time to time.**

This will help ensure that the parties signing the agreement are left in no doubt that they are encouraged to freely speak up about legitimate concerns. Employers may wish to clarify the process to follow and points of contact for a patient safety concern to be raised.

**6. Negotiating "without prejudice" and "subject to contract"**

While negotiating a settlement (compromise) agreement, it is advisable to mark the draft agreement and any related correspondence, as being "without prejudice" and "subject to contract".

"Without prejudice" means that any statements made in the course of negotiations cannot be used in evidence against the party that made them in any employment tribunal or court. It is important to note, however, that this rule only applies where the discussions are a genuine attempt to resolve an existing dispute between the individual(s) concerned.

"Subject to contract" means that the agreement cannot be relied upon by the employer or the employee concerned, until it has been signed by both parties. The use of "subject to contract" is considered enough to avoid any claims that an agreement was reached orally before the settlement (compromise) agreement was signed.

**7. Settlement (compromise) agreements and special severance payments**

HM Treasury define a special severance payment as a payment made to employees, contractors and others above normal statutory or contractual requirements when leaving employment in public service whether they resign, are dismissed or reach an agreed termination of contract.

 All special severance payments by NHS Bodies require Director General of Department of Health and Social Services approval as per Standing Financial Instructions and Manual of Accounts Guidance.

**8. Additional issues to consider**

• Ensure there are mechanisms in place to regularly review existing employment and contractual arrangements, which include confidentiality clauses within them, to ensure that they are in compliance with current legislation and relevant guidance.

• There is no duty to provide a reference to an employee (except in certain sectors of activity such as the financial services sector). However, any reference provided must in substance be true, accurate and fair. You have a duty of care not only to your ex-employee but also to future employers. This includes where an agreed reference is provided as one of the terms of a settlement (compromise) agreement.

• Ensure the settlement (compromise) agreement deals with post termination restrictions or restrictive covenants contained in the contract of employment- for example, those concerning the solicitation of clients, suppliers or employees.

**9. Legal requirements explained**

**Public Interest Disclosure Act (PIDA)**

The Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998 (PIDA) is known in the UK as the whistle-blowing law. All provisions of PIDA are incorporated within the Employment Rights Act 1996 (ERA), so you may also see reference to ERA in discussions about this area of the law. The Act gives statutory protection to employees who disclose information reasonably and responsibly in the public interest and where they have subsequently suffered a detriment or have been dismissed as a result of raising that concern, either internally or to a prescribed regulator. It outlines the various types of disclosure which may qualify for protection under the Act as:

*“Any disclosure of information which, in the reasonable belief of the worker making the disclosure, tends to show one or more of the following:*

*a. that a criminal offence has been committed is being committed or is likely to be committed,*

*b. that a person has failed, is failing or is likely to fail to comply with any legal obligation to which he is subject,*

*c. that a miscarriage of justice has occurred is occurring or is likely to occur,*

*d. that the health or safety of any individual has been, is being or is likely to be endangered,*

*e. that the environment has been, is being or is likely to be damaged, or*

*f. that the information tending to show any matter of failing within any one of the preceding paragraphs has been, or is likely to be deliberately concealed.”*

In summary, the Act makes it absolutely clear that any clause in terms of employment or contractual agreements, including severance agreements, which conflict with the protection afforded by the Act, will be made void by an employment tribunal or the Courts.

Individuals who have suffered a detriment for raising a protected concern under the Act can take their employer to an employment tribunal. Where they have lost their job because of raising a protected concern, they could be fully compensated for their losses; the limit to any compensation awarded is uncapped. Awards for detriment short of dismissal (e.g., being passed over for promotion) will also be uncapped and will be based on what is deemed just and equitable in all the circumstances.

**Employment Rights Act 1996**

Employers should also be aware that under the Employment Rights Act 1996 statutory protection is provided to employees who make a disclosure in the public interest.

Section 43 J - Contractual duties of confidentiality in the Act states:

*1) Any provision in an agreement to which this section applies is void in so far as it purports to preclude the worker from making a protected disclosure.*

*2) This section applies to any agreement between a worker and his employer (whether a worker's contract or not), including an agreement to refrain from instituting or continuing any proceedings under this Act or any proceedings for breach of contract.*

This statute means that it is unlawful for any employer to subject a worker to a detriment where they have made a protected disclosure.

This is also very likely to extend to clauses inserted into settlement (compromise) agreements which are aimed at preventing an employee from making a post-termination protected disclosure.

**Changes to the law – June 2013**

The UK Government announced in February 2013 that it would amend the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Bill, and strengthen existing protections for staff who raise a concern in the public interest. The amendments are now incorporated in the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013 which:

• extends employer accountability where staff are subjected to bullying or harassment from co-workers as a result of them reporting a concern. Previously, the law only provided protection where bullying and harassment came from the employer

• provides a defence for those employers who can demonstrate that they have taken all reasonable steps to prevent any such victimisation against those who speak up

• makes a change in the name of compromise agreements to "settlement" agreements; and

• introduces a change in the law to make offers of settlement in relation to termination of employment inadmissible in employment tribunal claims, providing there has been no improper behaviour in the process of discussing the agreement. This change in law has come about because of the current uncertainty around whether or not discussions, that take place at the end of the employment relationship, can be relied upon where it is unknown whether there is an existing dispute between the employer and employee.

To underpin the use of the new legislation the UK Government has asked ACAS to produce a statutory Code of Practice. Further information can be found on the [ACAS website](http://www.acas.org.uk/media/pdf/n/o/Acas-response-to-Settlement-Agreements-Code-June-2013.pdf).

To find out more information about the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act, please refer to the [Department of Business Innovation and Skills (BIS) website](https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/206077/bis-13-906-enterprise-and-regulatory-reform-act-2013-guide.pdf) .

**10. Additional documents**

**Settlement (compromise) agreements and severance arrangements:**

• [WHC (99) 156](http://howis.wales.nhs.uk/doclib/WHC%2899%29156.htm)

The Public Interest Disclosure Act (PIDA) provides that any clause or term in a contract, policy or other agreement between a worker and their employer is void insofar as it purports to preclude the worker from making a protected disclosure. Use of such clauses contravenes in the letter of guidance issued by the National Assembly for Wales to NHS organisations in Welsh Health Circular (99) 152. Point 8 (v) of the circular states that ***“every NHS Trusts and Health Authority should prohibit the use of “gagging” clauses in contracts of employment and compromise agreements which seek to prevent the disclosure of information in the public interest.”***

• [Guidance for employers within the NHS on the process for making severance payments](http://www.nhsemployers.org/Aboutus/Publications/Pages/Guidance-for-employers-within-NHS-on-process-for-severance-payments.aspx) - NHS Employers updated guidance in April 2013 to assist those handling special severance payments for employees and whilst specific to circumstances within the NHS in England the disciplines and processes outlined provide useful guidance for Health Boards and NHS Trusts in Wales..

**Raising concerns:**

• Web based resources for employers are available on the [NHS Employers website](http://www.nhsemployers.org/EMPLOYMENTPOLICYANDPRACTICE/UKEMPLOYMENTPRACTICE/RAISINGCONCERNS/Pages/Whistleblowing.aspx)

• Raising and acting on concerns about patient safety - the [General Medical Council (GMC)](http://www.gmc-uk.org/guidance/ethical_guidance/raising_concerns.asp) issued guidance to highlight the duty that all doctors have to take appropriate action should they believe a patients care, safety and dignity is at risk. The guidance published on 12th March 2012 sets out the GMCs expectations that all doctors, regardless of role will take such action to raise concerns. There are also comparable reporting requirements in the codes of conduct issued by the [Nursing and Midwifery Council (NMC)](http://www.nmc-uk.org/) and the [Health and Care Professions Council (HCPC)](http://www.hpc-uk.org/) to their own registrants.

• [Speak up for a healthy NHS](http://www.nhsemployers.org/SiteCollectionDocuments/Speak_Up_for_a_Healthy_NHSrd181011.pdf) - NHS Employers published guidance in June 2010 which focuses on supporting employers to promote best practice when devising, implementing and auditing their Raising Concerns (Whistleblowing) policies, including highlighting the importance of partnership working with trade unions to make sure responsibilities and processes are understood by all staff.

**Annex A**

Model clause[[1]](#endnote-2)

***“Confidential information”*** means any information of a confidential or secret nature relating to any and all aspects of the business of the Employer including but not limited to personnel data, financial information, budgets, reports, business plans, strategies, know-how, data, research, processes, procedures and programs, client/customer information, patient information, pricing, sales and marketing plans and details of past or proposed transactions whether or not written or computer generated or expressed in material form;

1. Confidentiality

1.1 In consideration of the Employer entering into and complying with its obligations under this Agreement, the Employee warrants that:

a. save for immediate family (having instructed them on all of the confidentiality provisions of this clause) and for the purposes of taking professional legal and financial advice or where required by any competent authority or by a Court of Law or HM Revenue and Customs or as otherwise required by law, [he/she] has not divulged and shall not divulge to any person whatsoever the fact of, negotiation and/or terms of this Agreement;

b. in accordance with [his/her] common law duties and [his/her] contractual duties under the Contract of Employment [he/she] will not disclose to any person (except as required by law) any Confidential Information concerning any matter relating to the business or affairs of the Employer or its directors, officers, agents, employees or patients which Confidential Information has been acquired by the Employee in the course of [his/her] employment unless such information comes into the public domain otherwise than by a breach of confidence on the part of the Employee; and

c. that [he/she] will not make or publish any untrue, disparaging, misleading or derogatory statements about matters concerning the Employer, its directors, officers or employees and/or take part in any conduct conducive or potentially conducive to bringing the Employer, its directors, officers, agents or employees into disrepute.

1.2 The Employer shall use its reasonable endeavours to ensure that its directors, officers, agents and employees shall not divulge the fact of, negotiation, nature and/or terms of the Agreement except to its professional advisers in connection with the conclusion of this Agreement or where required by any competent authority or Court of Law or HM Revenue & Customs or as otherwise required by law.

1.3 For the avoidance of doubt, nothing in this Clause [1] specifically and nothing in this Agreement generally, shall prejudice any rights that the Employee has or may have under the Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998 and/or any obligations that the Employee has or may have to raise concerns about patient safety and care with regulatory or other appropriate statutory bodies pursuant to [his/her] professional and ethical obligations including those obligations set out in guidance issued by regulatory or other appropriate statutory bodies from time to time.

1.4 With regard to the confidentiality obligations generally on either party in this Clause [1], nothing in those obligations shall prevent this Agreement from being subject to scrutiny by a statutory body tasked with the scrutiny of public bodies, such as the Wales Audit Office or the Public Accounts Committee.

1. This example of a confidentiality clause is an extract from the model template of a compromise agreement provided by Capsticks LLP (in January 2012) [↑](#endnote-ref-2)